وزارة التعليم العالي والبحث العلمي

MINISTERE DE L'ENSIGNEMENT SUPERIEUR ET DE LA RECHERCHE SCIENTIFIQUE

UNIVERSITE MOULOUD MAMMERI TIZI-OUZOU

FACULTE DES LETTRES ET DES LANGUES

DEPARTEMENT D'ANGLAIS

جامعة مولود معمري-تيزي وزو

كلية الآداب واللغات

Domaine : Lettres et Langues Etrangères

Filière : Langue Anglaise

Spécialité : Langue, Cultures des Pays Anglophones et Media.

Dissertation Submitted in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements

For the Degree of Master in English

Title:

Alienation in Erdrich Louise's *Love Medicine* (1993) and Jean Rhys' *Wide Sargasso Sea* (1966)

Presented by:

Ms. KHETTAL Thinhinane

Supervised by:

Mr. FERHI Samir

Board of Examiners:

Chair: Mr. HADDADOU Mohammed. MAA. UMMTO

Supervisor: Mr. FERHI Samir. MAA. UMMTO

Examiner: Mrs. HADJ-BACHIR. LARABI Sabeha MAA.UMMTO

№ D'Ordre :

№ De série :

Promotion: Septembre 2016

Laboratoire de domiciliation du master : Etude des Langues et Cultures Etrangères

To

My family, especially my parents and my grandmother.

My family in law, especially my dear fiancé.

My best friends.

Acknowledgement:

I would like to express my gratitude to my supervisor Mr FERHI Samir for his support, guidance and assistance. My thanks go also to the board of examiners for having accepted to examine and evaluate my work. Last but not least, I am grateful to my family, my dear fiancé, to my family in law and my best friends for their encouragement, patience and understanding.

Abstract:

This research work is meant to analyze the affinities between: Erdrich Louise's ***Love Medicine*** (1993) and Jean Rhys' ***Wide Sargasso Sea*** (1966) in relation to the issue of alienation. To support our research, we rely on Harold Bloom's theory of alienation; ***Bloom's Literary Themes: Alienation*** (2009).This work discusses this notion referring to Bloom's concepts namely: the concept of Family, Religion and faith, marriage and cultural belonging. After our analysis, we reached the results that both authors share affinities, first, in the way they present their characters struggling with the surrounding conditions. Then, in the way they develop the different kinds of alienation as prominent themes in both works. Finally, we examine the way they use diction, imagery, details, language and syntax to express their resistance against alienation.

Table of Contents:

Dedication
Acknowledgement
Contents
Abstract

I. General introduction……...1
Review of literature.....2
Issue and Working Hypothesis.....5
End notes.....7

II. Method and Materials.....9

1. Method.....9
Bloom's Literary Themes: Alienation.....9

2. Materials.....12
a- Biography of Jean Rhys.....12
b- Summary of Jean Rhys' Wide Sargasso Sea.....12
c- Biography of Erdrich Louise.....14
d- Summary of Erdrich Louise's Love Medicine.....14
End notes.....17

III.Results.....18

IV. Discussion.....21

Chapter one: Characterization and Alienation.....21
a- Lipsha Morrissey and Antoinette Cosway.....21
b- Female Characterization and Alienation: Marie Lazzare and Antoinette Cosway.....24
c- End notes.....30

Chapter two: kinds of Alienation.....32
a- Alienation from Family.....32
b- Alienation from Religion and Faith.....34
c- Alienation from Marriage.....37
d- Alienation from Cultural Belonging.....38
End notes.....40

Chapter three: The attitudes of the authors: Resistance to Alienation.....43
End notes.....48

General Conclusion.....50

Bibliography.....52

I. General Introduction :

The subject matter of this research work is to study the theme of 'Alienation' in both Native American and Caribbean contemporary literature, through the comparison of two novels: Erdrich Louise's ***Love Medicine*** (1993) and Jean Rhys' ***Wide Sargasso Sea*** (1966).

The word 'Alienation' is worldwide issue. One cannot provide a single definition to this concept for, it is wide and complex. Its definition differs from one critic to another and from one context to another. For instance, Karl Marx links it to social classes and capitalism[1], while Erich Fromm relates it to the self [2]. In addition, its meaning also differs from one field to another such as: psychology, sociology and religion. This word is referred to as isolation, loss and estrangement. Thus, one may just say that 'Alienation' is a human condition and nobody can remain all his life unaffected in one way or another.

Since long time, 'Alienation' is also an important and recurrent theme in literature. It seems that the aspects of this issue in its different and various forms have been the source of interest for several literary works and studies mainly in the Contemporary era. Thus, contemporary writers cannot remain immune to what is happening in their society without pointing it out. 'Alienation' has also been a subject that inspired Native American and Caribbean modern writers such as: Erdrich Louise and Jean Rhys.

On the one hand, Erdrich Louise is a Native American writer. She is a mestizo of hybrid origins. She is of Native American and European descent. She explores Indian American concerns in her works. In her first fiction entitled: ***Love Medicine*** (1993), she develops the theme of alienation and the way it affects humanity in general and Native American society in particular. While reading the novel, one notices the characters' alienation from their families, religion, society and culture as well.

On the other hand, Jean Rhys is West Indian Creole writer. In her work, ***Wide Sargasso Sea*** (1966), she examines the issue of alienation in the Caribbean society mainly the Jamaican one. Parallel to Erdrich Louise's characters, Rhys' characters reflect the psychological, individual, social and cultural alienation of the individuals who try to identify themselves with their surroundings.

The reasons which encouraged us to undertake this study come first from our interest in the kind of works studied in comparative literature. Second, although Erdrich Louise and Jean Rhys belong to distant and separate societies in time and space, whose people had different cultures, beliefs and speak different languages; it seems that their preoccupations in their works are not dissimilar. Thus, alienation is the common theme in both works that makes the two authors closer.

Review of the literature:

Erdrich Louise's ***Love Medicine*** (1984) and Jean Rhys' ***Wide Sargasso Sea*** (1966) have received a large bulk of criticism carried out from different perspectives.

To start with Erdrich Louise's ***Love Medicine***, Karla Sanders is one of its illustrative critics. In her academic journal article entitled: ***"A Healthy Balance: Religion, Identity and Community in Erdrich Louise Love Medicine"*** (1998)**,** she argues that Louise Erdrich presents her characters between two ambivalent and collided worlds. On the one hand, the world of their ancestors and that of Whites. On other the hand, their tribal faith and Catholicism. Karla Sanders asserts that the characters' struggle between the two environments creates on them complexities to reach "a healthy balance"[3] and harmony with the "two opposed cultures"[4].

> Love Medicine presents characters searching for a healthy balance between seemingly diametrically opposed cultures. This search for a healthy balance is evinced in the

> characters' belief systems, in their relationships with each other, and within their own sense of personal identity [5]

In her article, entitled ***''The Impossibility of American Identity in Louise Erdrich's Love Medicine''*** (2008), Andrea P. Balogh regards ***Love Medicine*** as an "implicit post colonial narrative"[6]. According to her, Erdrich Louise in this novel "insists on her hybrid origin"[7] and emphasizes on "the hybridity of her characters"[8]. The reviewer argues that the author provides "a postcolonial re-assessment"[9] that denounces, through 'Nector' and 'Marie', the Euro-American "stereotypes"[10] towards the natives and the reservation. She adds that Erdrich Louise describes "the hypocrisy of the catholic church"[11] through the mixed-blood character "Marie".

Melisssa Schoeffel deals with the maternal conditions in Erdrich Louise's ***Love Medicine***. The reviewer states that Erdrich's portrayal of lost and "absent mothers"[12] in the novel is a "structuring device"[13] that one can identify "as stand-ins for lost communities"[14]. She illustrates her view through the character 'June Kashpaw', who is unable "to be a mother to either of her sons, nor is she able to be mothered by her aunt/step mother, Marie"[15]. M. Schoeffel associates Lipsha's quest for his origins to the Native American quest for identity. She asserts that the appearance of June dead and voiceless in the novel symbolizes the "fragmentation of Native American culture and community"[16] and the lost Native "tradition"[17].

Much critical work has been also devoted to Jean Rhys' ***Wide Sargasso Sea*** (1966) from different perspectives.

In recent years, Silvia Panizza, in her article: ***"Double Complexity in Jean Rhys Wide Sargasso Sea"*** (2009), argues that the novel, mainly its heroine, reflects the author's difficulties either to belong to the "Caribbean origins"[18] or to integrate "into the British

society”[19]. Therefore, she displays her heroine struggling for identity between “two opposed worlds”[20]. As a result, she does not belong to none of these worlds. S.Panizza delineates that Jean Rhys’ heroine’s “quest for identity”[21] is determined by “an impossible integration”[22] that creates alienation, “inner struggle”[23] and “psychological troubles”[24].

Rula B.Qawas, in her illuminative critic ***“The Politics of Gender, Class, and Race in Jean Rhys Wide Sargasso Sea”*** (2008)**,** argues that Jean Rhys’ novel can be studied from a postcolonial perspective. She says: “It is also no wonder that Wide Sargasso Sea, a novel that takes place in the Caribbean soon after the Emancipation Act 1833”[25]. She refers to Rhys writing back to Bronte’s Jane Eyre and declares that “Rhys enacts a moment of intersexuality between the nineteenth-century novel of ***Jane Eyre*** and her own”[26]. She asserts that Jean Rhys’ ***Wide Sargasso Sea*** “gives Charlotte Bronte’s “mad woman in the attic” an identity and a background”[27]. The reviewer also mentions a struggle between the catholic religion of “Rochester” and “Christophine’s insights and powers”[28]. Moreover, she argues that the White Creole protagonist is “an introduction to the race relations in the island”[29] that represents “a background of slavery”[30].

In their book entitled ***Multicultural Writers Since 1945:An A-to-Z Guide*** *(2004)*, Alba Amoia and Bettina L. Knapp consider Jean Rhys’s ***Wide Sargasso Sea*** as Rhy’s personal experience. According to them, Antoinette’s life represents Rhys’ and the white Creoles’ experience of “the marginality of living between two cultures”[31].They view that Rhys protagonist bears “the slavery and the cruelties committed of her ancestors”[32].

We argue that the above literary critics succeeded to study the two narratives from different perspectives like: feminist, postcolonial... then, discuss different issues and struggles in each work such as: family, race, religion, culture and identity. However, one may point out that they have failed to associate these matters to an apparent and major issue in both novels

which is: alienation. We think that the characters' struggle with the various issues cause their fatal estrangement and isolation.

Issue and Working Hypothesis:

From the above review of literature, it is clear that many studies have been devoted to both works, and that all the critics contributed to a better understanding of both novels. However, we think that no work has ventured so for to undertake a comparative study between these two literary works.

Therefore, in this piece of research, we suggest a comparative study between Erdrich Louise's ***Love Medicine*** (1984) and Jean Rhys' ***Wide Sargasso Sea*** (1966). So, our intention is to carry research and to study the issue of alienation presented in both works. We intend to emphasize on the study of characters, themes and the attitude of the authors in both texts relying mainly on the theme of alienation. In addition to the affinities between the authors' hybrid origins and similar experiences, it is also important to mention that the two works have been written in contemporary era.

In order to achieve our purpose, we will rely on Harold Bloom's theory of alienation in Literary ***Themes: Alienation*** (2009). We have chosen this theory because it seems to fit our study since it is recent and deals with the theme of Alienation from different sides, through the characters, various themes and presents the authors' attitude towards it also.

Our research work will follow the IMRAD methodological guidelines. Thus, we will divide it into sections. The first section is devoted to the General introduction. We have introduced the purpose of our research and the theme of alienation, and then we made a review of the literature that studied the works apart from different perspective such as feminist and post colonial ones. We find in this part of Issue and Working Hypothesis that a

comparative study between Erdrich Louise's ***Love Medicine*** and Jean Rhys' ***Wide Sargasso Sea*** is missed. What follows as a second section is The Method and Materials. In the method, we will try to introduce Harold Bloom's theory. In materials, we shall present the biographies of each author and the summaries of both novels.

The Results section will show our findings reached after study and discussion. In the Discussion section, we will apply the theory and discuss the concept of alienation in both novels. The discussion will be divided into three chapters. In the first, we will analyze the theme of alienation through parallel characters. In the second, we will discuss the parallel themes related to alienation as they are presented in both works. Then, in the last one, we will study the attitude of the authors towards alienation through the use of diction, imagery, language, details and syntax. Finally, we will conclude with a General conclusion which will sum up the general ideas developed in the research work.

End notes:

[1] Loyd D.Easton and Kurt H. Guddat . 1967.From: Writings of the Young Marx on Philosophy. Garden City, New York: Doubleday & Company (Anchor Books),1

[2] Fromm, Erich. 1991. The Sane Society. London: Rutledge, 117.

[3] Sanders, Karla. 1998. "A Healthy Balance: Religion, Identity, and Community in Louise Erdrich's Love Medicine". MELUS 23 (2):129. doi: 10.2307/ 468016,1.

[4] Ibid .,1.

[5] Ibid .,1.

[6] Andrea P, Balogh. 2008. The Impossibility of American Identity in Louise Erdrich's Love Medicine,1.

[7]Ibid.,1.

[8] Ibid.,1.

[9] Ibid.,1.

[10] Ibid.,1.

[11] Ibid.,1.

[12] Schoeffel, Melissa A. 2008. Maternal Conditions. New York: Peter Lang, 72.

[13] Ibid., 72

[14] Ibid., 72

[15] Ibid.,74

[16] Ibid.,74

[17] Ibid.,74

[18]Silvia, Panizza.2009. Double Complexity in Jean Rhys Wide Sargasso Sea. Quaderni Di Palazzo Serra. Genova, 1.

[19] Ibid.,1.

[20] Ibid.,2.

[21] Ibid.,11.

[22] Ibid.,6

[23] Ibid.,6

[24] Ibid.,6

[25] Rula, B.Qawas. 2004. The Politics of Gender, Class, and Race in Jean Rhys Wide Sargasso Sea. DAR Publishers/ University of Jordan, 366.

[26] Ibid.,364

[27] Ibid.,366

[28]Ibid.,371.

[29]Ibid.,368

[30] Ibid.,368.

[31]Amoia,Alba della Fazia and Bettina Liebowitz Knapp. 2004. Multicultural Writers Since 1945. Westport, conn.:Greenwood,423.

[32] Ibid.,423.

II. Method and Materials:

1. Method :

In order to analyze the concept of alienation in Erdrich Louise's ***Love Medicine*** (1993) and Jean Rhys' ***Wide Sargasso Sea*** (1966), we have chosen to apply as a theory Harold Bloom's ***Bloom's Literary Themes: Alienation*** (2009). We selected some of his reprinted and edited critical articles in such works as: Thomas Stearns Eliot's ***The Waste Land*** by Mathew J. Bolt, J. D. Salinger's ***The Catcher in the Rye*** by Robert C. Evans, William Shakespeare's ***Hamlet*** by Johann Wolfgang von Goethe and Richard Wright's ***The Black Boy*** by Ralph Ellison to analyze some concepts related to alienation in both novels, such as: family, marriage, religion and faith and cultural belonging.

H. Bloom distinguishes two meanings of alienation. On the one hand, he distinguishes a simple meaning where he defines it as "a condition of being estranged from someone or something"[1]. On the other hand, a technical meaning where he associates it to different contexts according to the different fields such as: law, psychology, sociology and many others. He refers to its meaning in law as "a conveyance of property"[2]. In social psychology, He regards it as the "person's psychological withdrawal from society"[3]. This kind of alienation causes the person's isolation from other people. In literature, he relates it to "the psychological isolation from community and society"[4]. Harold Bloom also adopts the idea of Karl Marx to define alienation in the critical social theory. He linked it to labour and "the capitalist mode of production"[5]. He asserts that this system of production makes of labourers "machines"[6] and makes the individuals isolated from society and alienated from one another. Bloom views it as "the economic separation of man from his fellow man"[7]

In ***Bloom's Literary Themes: Alienation***, Johann Wolfgang von Goethe argues that alienation from family is a result of parents' neglect to their children. Thus, when parents

reject their children, they reject them in turn. According to him, the abandoned children feel more alienated than orphans because it creates in them many problems such as exclusion from youth, and the feeling of "nothingness"[8]. Furthermore, Mathew J. Bolt claims that "marriage, an institution intended to unite people, has brought only further division"[9]. He regards loveless marriage as "an alienating institution"[10] that has "no sense of communion"[11]. The theorist believes that alienation from marriage may result from the no distinction between "the sacrament of marriage"[12] and the illegitimate relationships outside marriage. Moreover, Robert C. Evans also explores the alienation from religion in J.D. Salinger's ***The Catcher in the Rye***. He outlines that the religious institutions (convent, nuns) are corrupted and they even affect the relationship of the individual with God. He asserts that religion is not a preventable atmosphere from alienation. Robert C. Evans maintains that "God and religion no longer occupy central places of respect, veneration, or even serious attention"[13] in the life of the alienated individuals. He adds that alienation from religion may even extend to doubt in God's "possible existence"[14] or even to deny it by regarding him as "mostly absent"[15]. He argues that "god and Christianity are a convenient source of profanity"[16] and he regard them "as practical and consoling alternatives to alienation"[17]. C. Evans declares that the belief in "the old certitudes, the old hopes and faith"[18] of earlier people give "structure and meaning to the lives"[19] of these old people, but he points out that "these are naive times"[20]. So, according to him, religion may not be "the viable" [21] or "solution to the alienated condition of life in modern society"[22]. In Richard Wright's ***Black Boy***, Ralph Ellison tackles the alienation of the individuals from culture, and community. The struggle between two worlds refers to the struggle for "the existence of personality"[23]. He argues that when "two cultures merged"[24] and fuse by "the brutal environment"[25] which does not allow the integration of the individual corrupts the personality. Besides the above analysis of the theme of alienation from different sides through the characters and themes, they also examine the attitude of the authors toward

alienation through diction, imagery, language details and syntax. So, we adopted the way they analyze the writer's attitude to examine both Erdrich Louise's and Jean Rhys' attitude toward alienation in the two narratives.

2.Materials:

a-Biography of Rhys:

Ella Gwendolen Rees Williams, known as Jean Rhys, was born on August 24, 1890 in Roseau, Dominica, West Indies. She is mixed blood of Creole descent. She grows up alienated and isolated in the Caribbean. She is the author of many novels such as: ***Voyage in the Dark*** (1934), ***Good morning, Midnight***(1939) and she published many essays and numerous volumes in poetry. She married three times. After her divorce from her first husband she went to England where she lived in poverty. Jean Rhys disappeared from the public view and literary stage from 1955 to 1960 till she was believed dead. She was arrested in 1958. After many years of obscurity, Rhys published ***wide Sargasso Sea*** in 1966, as a revision of charlotte Bronte's Jane Eyre (1910). Jean Rhys drunk alcohol with abuse till the end of her life on may 14,1979. Displacement, isolation and Alienation remain the recurring themes in her writing mainly in wide Sargasso Sea.

b- Summary of Wide Sargasso sea :

Rhys' ***Wide Sargasso Sea*** (1966) is a novel divided into three parts each part is subdivided into sections. The first part is narrated by the protagonist of the novel Antoinette Cosway. She is a Creole. Antoinette relates her childhood at Coulibri with her neglecting mother and sick brother Pierre. They were financially exhausted after her father's death. The young girl received less care and attention from her mother who favoured her son. As a result the protagonist becomes attached to the black servant 'Christophine', her surrogate mother. Christophine protects her from the blacks who despised the protagonist's Creole family. Antoinette had only one close friend ''Tia'' a black girl. She spends most of her time with her when her mother marries an English man named ''Mr Mason'' who made their life better.

Annette wanted to leave Coulibri because of the blacks' anger of them, however, Mr Mason ignored Annette's suggestions. As a result, the blacks burn their house in an uprising against them. ''Pierre'' was injured, then, Annette's state becomes worse. After some weeks, Antoinette learns that he died. Antoinette was hurt by her closest friend Tia in her head by a stone and this show how disloyal Tia was to her. The family becomes more disunited. Annette goes mad and the young girl leaves with Aunt Cora to the Spanish town. When her Aunt went to England, the girl is send to a convent. School she describes the convent as her refuge to some extent but it does not cure the feeling of loneliness. In the second section, Mr Mason visited her each time, and then takes her outside.

The second part, Antoinette marries an Englishman who came to Jamaica in order to make his fortune because his father dispossessed him from wealth. Richard Mason arranges their marriage without knowing anything of each other. The couple live in quietness till the unnamed husband receives a letter from Antoinette's half brother 'Daniel Cosway'. The latter asserts that madness is hereditary in his wife's family. The letter disturbs the husband who visited Daniel later on. The problems started in the couple. Antoinette feared to lose her husband. She went to Christophine to get advice and use her insights 'Obeah'. When she came back, she finds the husband betrayed her with her servant. Antoinette tried to tell him the truth but he did not listen to her. The nameless husband changes Antoinette's name to 'Bertha' to disgust and disturb her. By the end, he forces her to leave Jamaica and go to England. He condemns her in a room and points 'Grace Poole' as her caretaker. The nameless husband declares Antoinette mad and inherits all her estate. By the end, Antoinette has a nightmare, she wakes up and acts it .She sets fire on the house that seems to her as a light for the dark space where she is condemned.

c- Biography of Erdrich Louise:

Karen Erdrich Louise was born in 1954, in Little Falls, Minnesota. She is of German-Ojibwe descent. Erdrich Louise is the author of several novels such as: ***Love Medicine***, ***Tracks*** (1988), the writer of many poems as: Jacklight (1984), Baptism of Desire (1989) and children's books like: ***Birtchbark House*** (1999) ***The Game of Silence*** (2005).

Erdrich Louise explores mostly Native American experiences, lives and culture in her works. She employs Native American characters and sometimes even hybrid characters to represent her hybrid heritage. Erdrich's style is compared to that of William Faulkner mainly in her use of multi-voice narration and non chronological story telling such as Faulkner's ***As I lay dying***.

d- Summary of Love *Medicine*:

Love Medicine is Erdrich Louise's first fiction. It was first published in (1984). The author revised it in a new and expanded edition in (1993), then, in (2009). Our research paper is concerned with the 1993 edition. This novel consists of eighteen linked short stories told by different narrators. They relate fifty years of the characters' lives from (1934) to (1984). The novel opens with the death of 'June Kashpaw' in a snow storm, in her way back to the reservation. Her niece 'Albertine' is angry of her mother 'Zelda' because she does not inform her about 'June's death lest to disturb her studies. The members of the family gather in their grandparents' house. June's son 'King' arrives with his wife 'Lynette' and their son 'King Junior. Albertine relates the family's meeting. She describes her grandfather lost his memory, king mistreats Lynette. Lipsha Morrissey blames his parents because of their abandonment. In the next story, in 1934, Marie, the grandmother, recounts her experience in the convent school. She describes her misery in the Sacred Heart Convent. She escapes from there. In her way, she meets 'Nector Kashpaw' and they get married later on. The following story is told by 'Nector'. He relates his meeting and marriage with Marie though he is in love with another

woman ’Lulu Lamartine’. Lulu recounts the following story. She describes her pain when she loses her mother then her beloved Nector. Therefore, she goes in search of ‘Moses Pillager’. She finds him; they get married and get a child. Marie tells the fifth story in 1948. She tells June’s story when she was child. Marie adopted June then her son Lipsha. She speaks of her poverty and misery with her neglecting husband and his mother ‘Rushes Bear’. The next story elapsed in 1957. Lulu became Henry Lamartine’s widow. She marries his brother Beverley and get a child called ’Henry Junior’. Beverley leaves Lulu and marries another woman. In the following story, in 1957,Nector Kashpaw narrates his experiences in Hollywood as an actor. Then, he relates his relationship with Lulu and his meeting with Marie. He is in confusion whether he stays with his wife ‘Marie’ or goes to his real love ‘Lulu’. By the end, he leaves his wife and lives with his beloved. They get a child then she leaves him to live again with Beverley. Marie relates again the following story in 1957. She tells her visit to the convent because Sister Leopolda is ill. When she comes back, she finds Nector’s letter. He informs her that he will live with Lulu who loves more. The ninth story elapses in 1973.Albertine relates her experience in the city and her love affair with Henry Junior Lamartine. In the following story, in 1974, Lyman buys a car with his brother Henry. He is a Vietnam War veteran. He jumps to the river and makes no sign of life. The next story is in 1980. Albertine tells the story of Gerry Nanapush. He is often in prison and escaped each time. Once, he escapes in order to attend his child’s birth, unfortunately, he is caught before. Then in 1981, Albertine describes Gordie’s depression and drinking all the time after June’s death. He hallucinates that he kills June. In the thirteenth short story, in 1982, Lipsha shows his gratitude to his grandparents who raises him. Marie asks him to use his touch to regain Nector. His touch fails. He is inspired by a couple of geese. He targets many times to get their hearts as love medicine but he fails. He buys hearts of frozen turkeys instead. Marie prepares them and insists on Nector to eat them. As a result, he dies. The following story is

told from third person perspective. Gordie searches alcohol, he does not find. So, he attempts to suicide but Marie saves him. In the next story, entitled The Good Tears 1983, Lulu Lamartine expresses her sadness toward Nector's death. She becomes a close friend to Marie. She is ill and the latter takes care of her. In Lyman's luck story 1983, Lyman manages a factory which produces Indian artefacts. It becomes bankrupt. Then, he opens a casino instead. In the last story 1984, Lipsha Morrissey learns about his real parents, 'June Morrissey' and 'Gerry Nanapush', from his paternal grandmother 'Lulu'. He visits his half brother, king, to meet his father there. He spends some moments with him before he crosses the Canadian borders without being aware of his child's existence. Lipsha denies that June is his mother by the end of the novel.

End notes:

[1] Bloom, Harold.2009. Bloom's Literary Themes: Alienation. Blake Hobby, 2.

[2]Ibid.,2.

[3] Ibid.,2.

[4]Ibid.,2.

[5]Ibid.,2.

[6] Ibid.,2.

[7] Ibid.,2.

[8]Ibid.,87

[9]Ibid.,198.

[10]Ibid.,198.

[11]Ibid.,198.

[12] Ibid.,199.

[13] Ibid.,45

[14] Ibid.,46

[15] Ibid.,44

[16] Ibid.,46

[17] Ibid.,46

[18] Ibid.,46

[19] Ibid.,46

[20] Ibid.,46

[21]Ibid.,49

[22]Ibid.,49

[23] Ibid.,24.

[24]Ibid.,24.

[25] Ibid.,25.

III. Results:

In this piece of research, we have made a comparative study between Erdrich Louise's ***Love Medicine*** (1993) and Jean Rhys' ***Wide Sargasso Sea*** (1966). We have noticed that the two narratives share affinities in relation to the issue of alienation. We have applied Harold Bloom, ***Bloom's Literary Themes: Alienation*** (2009) as a theory. We have mainly focused on his concepts of alienation: from family, religion and faith, from marriage, cultural belonging, and examined the attitude of the authors toward this issue through diction, imagery and language. We have reached the result that this theory is suitable to our study.

In the first section, entitled characterization and alienation, we have analyzed the characters of both novels in relationship to alienation. We have drawn parallels between Lipsha Morrissey and Antoinette Cosway, then between Marie Lazzare and Antoinette. We have deduced that both Lipsha Morrissey and Antoinette Cosway lived a painful childhood characterized by their parents' rejection and abandonment. We have found that the parents' neglect to the children created in them alienation from family. As a result, the children rejected their parents in turn. Then, we have realized through our comparison of Marie Lazzare and Antoinette that both of them are connected to the different kinds of alienation. We have noticed that both Marie and Antoinette are disillusioned from religion. They did not reach what they seek for such as peace and acceptance because of the corruption of religious institutions. Then, they chose marriage as an option to their alienation. Both protagonists sacrificed in their marriage, hopeful to find security, love and protection. However, we have deduced that marriage disappointed their hopes and made them more alienated. Both protagonists did find neither communion nor the love they wished. We have also noted of our analysis to these two characters that they suffer from cultural dilemmas that create in them alienation from cultural belonging. Marie is excluded from White community and not

accepted in Native American one. Antoinette is rejected from both Black and British community.

We have deduced from the first chapter that the most prominent themes are: alienation from family, from religion and faith, from marriage and from cultural belonging. Hence, in the second chapter, entitled Kinds of Alienation, we have developed these different kinds as themes. We have noticed through our discussion of alienation from family that the latter does not represent a peaceful nor protective place from Alienation. The parents' inattention and miscommunication with their children leads to the latter's psychological instability and estrangement. Then, in the second kind, we deduce that religion and faith are not preventable from alienation. The corruption of the religious institions affected even the relationship of the individuals with God. So, we have noted that the characters of both novels either "rarely acknowledge the god's possible existence"[1] or regard him as "mostly absent"[2]. Then, the characters of both narratives appeal to their Native shamanisms to delineate their loss between the old faith and catholic religion. Through the discussion of alienation from marriage, we have found that there is neither intimacy nor communication between the couples: Nector and Marie then, between Antoinette and the unnamed husband. The "sacrament of marriage"[3] in both works is lost because of the illegitimate relationships. Hence, we have reached the result that this affected the female protagonists negatively since it created in them alienation and deception again and it "has brought only further division"[4]. In our analysis to the last kind, we have noticed that both Marie and Antoinette suffer from cultural traumas from both societies. They are rejected because they are of mixed blood.

In the third chapter, we have analyzed both Erdrich Louise's and Jean Rhys attitudes toward alienation. We have relied on Harold Bloom's analysis of the diction, imagery and language used to depict the authors' attitudes. We have applied it and have reached the result

that Erdrich Louise's and Jean Rhys' attitudes in both works in relationship to alienation is resistance.

End notes:

[1] Bloom, Harold.2009. Bloom's Literary Themes: Alienation. Blake Hobby,46.

[2] Ibid.,44.

[3] Ibid.,199.

[4] Ibid.,198.

IV. Discussion:

Chapter one: characterization and alienation:

This chapter aims to draw parallels between the characters of ***Love Medicine*** and ***Wide Sargasso Sea*** in relationship to the theme of alienation. In fact, Erdrich Louise and Jean Rhys present the characters of their narratives as models of alienated individuals suffering and struggling with the surrounding conditions that affect their beliefs and complicate their lives, because of estrangement. It seems to us that the parallels which we can make between the two works are through the following characters: 'Lipsha Morrissey' and 'Antoinette Cosway' in relationship to their alienation from their family, mainly from their parents. Then, the heroines of the novels: 'Marie Lazzare Kashpaw' and 'Antoinette Cosway', concerning their alienation from religion, in their marriage and even from their cultural heritage and belonging.

a- Erdrich's Lipsha Morissey and Rhys'Antoinette Cosway as Alienated Children:

Erdrich Louise and Jean Rhys reveal the importance of children-parents good relationship and its effect on children's psychology. Both authors depict the two characters as rejected and abandoned by their careless parents.

On the one hand, in ***Love Medicine***, Erdrich Louise explains the hardship of children's life when they lack love and affection. 'Lipsha Morrissey', as an illustrative case of these children, suffers from alienation. He is unaware of his real parentage till his youth age. His awareness may be late since his mother 'June Kashpaw' died. However, Erdrich believes that even if 'June' were alive, she would not take care of him "She had no patience with children. She wasn't much as a mother; everyone in the family said so"[1]. Lipsha adds "my own mother,

who wants to tie me in a potato sack and throw me in a slough”[2]. Therefore, contrary to the basis of motherhood, ‘June Kashpaw’ does not assume her status as a mother efficiently. Moreover, Erdrich states that ‘June’ acknowledged ‘King’, her son from another man. After her death, he inherited her insurance. Louise Erdrich states the painfully obvious of Lipsha’s estrangement from his mother because she does not acknowledge his existence and deserts him from inheritance. While an ideal mother embodies a source of tenderness, affection and sacrifice, ‘June’ sacrificed her child but not for him. She does not afford him the warmth of a mother’s lap which makes the child feels in security and peace. Erdrich presents ‘Lipsha’ alienated even from his paternal side. His relationship with his father is not better than that with his mother. His father ‘Gerry Nanapush’ married another woman and got another daughter. ‘Gerry’ is unaware of his son since he was not aware of June’s pregnancy. Despite this, he is always wanted and imprisoned. Lipsha says “dangerous armed criminal”[3], “that was...Dad”[4]. Apparently, Erdrich Louise suggests that these reasons create in Lipsha a kind of alienation.

On the other hand, Jean Rhys displays her protagonist fallen into isolation and loneliness as a result of carelessness and neglect. Antoinette Cosway is portrayed deserted by her parents’ inattention. The author shows Antoinette godforsaken as a result of her alienation. Rhys elucidates the child’s need for the stand of one of the parents with him when the other is absent. She asserts that when the child is put in an atmosphere of closeness, devotion and kindness, he will feel in security and safety. But when he is rejected, the case of ‘Antoinette Cosway’. The child’s situation becomes worse and harder. Her father died when she was a child. Yet, when he was alive, he spent most of his time drinking without caring of his family, till he drove himself to death “dead drunk from morning till night and he die raving and cursing”[5]. Antoinette’s mother ‘Annette Cosway’ seems no longer supports her heavy responsibility which is to take care of two children in poverty. Antoinette announces

“my mother always said, if she had not stayed with us”[6]. The author seems that she tries to lighten the reasons behind the young girl’s alienation. She states her painful childhood which is characterized by her parents’ disregard. Rhys describes her heroine isolated from her mother who favours her troubled son. When she tries to approach her mother, the latter prefers to stay with her son or alone. Annette forgets that her daughter needs protection too. The young girl finds excuses to be close to her mother. The former feels safe close to her mother while the latter feels relieved when she is far from her daughter.

> I started to fan her, but she turned her head away .She might rest if I left her alone, she said. Once I would have gone back quietly to watch her asleep on the blue sofa-once I made excuses to be near her when she brushed her hair, a soft black cloak to cover me ,hide me, keep me safe. But no longer. Not any more.[7]

As a result, Antoinette spends most of her time lonely and isolated. Then, it seems that she is more attached to her surrogate mother ‘Christophine’ who takes care of her, advises and even protects her. Antoinette says “and here is Christophine who was my da, my nurse long ago”[8], she adds “when she bent her head she looked old and I thought, ‘Oh Christophine, do not grow old. You are the only friend I have, do not go away from me into being old”[9].Antoinette feels alone in Christophine’s absence. Hence, she describes her feeling in the company of her surrogate mother as “the safe peaceful feeling”[10].

Parallel to Antoinette, Lipsha has full regard to ‘Marie’, his grandmother and surrogate mother too, as he asserts “Sure I was grateful to my Grandma Kashpaw for saving me like that, for raising me”[11]. The attention and the care that both children receive from their surrogate mothers made these latter dearer.

Erdrich Louise and Jean Rhys seem affected by the children’s alienation from their parents. As H. Bloom asserts that when a child is rejected by his parents, he rejects them in turn. So, it seems to us that both Lipsha and Antoinette reject their parents by the end.Lipsha denies his mother because of his sufferings as an abandoned child. He felt like a beggar at the

table of life”[12].He is regarded by others as “little orphant”[13] and not as “real children”[14].The child declares that he is not June Kashpaw’s son and he insists that his real mother is Marie. So, Lipsha rejects his parents mainly his mother: “How weakly I remembered her. If it made any sense at all, she was part of the great loneliness being carried up the driving current”[15]. He insists that “even if she came back right now, this minute, and got down her knees and said ‘son, I am sorry for what I done to you, I would not relent on her”[16].

Antoinette too, rejects her mother. Her estrangement makes her feel “useless”[15] to her mother. She considers her dead “She did die when I was child. There are always two deaths, the real and the one people know about”[17]. She regards her mother’s neglect and regardless as real death.

we think that both ***Love Medicine***’s Lipsha and ***Wide Sargasso Sea***’s Antoinette represent the state of alienated children, that according to Harold Bloom starts with parents neglect and rejection, then develops the feeling of alienation and loneliness in children. Consequently, they feel in “nothighness”[18] and uselessness that push them to reject their parents in turn.

b- Female characterization and Alienation :

The purpose of this part is to make parallels between the protagonists of the two works, regarding their experiences with the harsh environment that surrounds them and creates in them troubles and alienation in spite of their struggle and resistance. Erdrich Louise and Jean Rhys display their two characters in search of peace and acceptance. They believe that God may empower their faith and religion may save them from their struggle with life.

Love Medicine’s protagonist ‘Marie’ initiates her will to become a nun. When she was fourteen, she joined the ‘Sacred Heart Convent’. Erdrich Louise depicts Marie’s enthusiasm and big hopes to find comfort in religion, thus she portrays her as a hard prayer. Marie asserts

“I prayed”[19], “I prayed very hard”[20]. However; this strong desire to become a nun, does not cure her from pain. She was in conflict with Sister Leopolda who mistreated her violently. Erdrich describes the convent as an insecure place where safety and mind’s ease that Marie wants to achieve are not present. Therefore, the young girl keeps her thoughts outside the convent; she says “I had the mail-order catholic soul you get in a girl raised out in the bush, whose only thought is getting into town”[21]. So, the author of the novel claims that even though her protagonist prays hard, she does not do it from heart.

In ***Wide Sargasso Sea***, Antoinette Cosway escapes from her surrounding misery to the convent’s tranquillity, she says “This convent is my refuge”[22] and “a place of sunshine”[23]. Once, when she was praying, she asks herself if she can pray also for “happiness”[24]. She asks “But what about Happiness, I thought at first, is there no happiness? There must be”[25], then she asserts “I prayed for a long time”[26]. Antoinette is described praying hard to achieve the goal that she is in quest which is ecstasy. However, even if she prays hard, her thoughts are always related to the world outside the convent. She thinks of her mother’s death and funeral, of Christophine and Mr Mason too. The protagonist seems searching for security and peace of mind too. She seems no more in relief when she prays. She declares, “I prayed, but words fell to the ground meaning nothing”[27], she affirms then, “I did not pray so often after that and soon, hardly at all. I felt bolder, happier, more free, but not safe”[28].

Erdrich Louise and Jean Rhys display the two protagonists alienated from religion, since they do not achieve their goals. In ***Love Medicine***, Marie declares, “I despaired. I felt I had no inside voice, nothing to direct me, no darkness, no Marie”[29]. In ***Wide Sargasso Sea***, Antoinette also maintains that religion is “presumption or despair”[30]. It seems that Erdrich Louise and Jean Rhys show clearly through Marie and Antoinette, what Harold Bloom implies in his book **Bloom’s Literary Themes: Alienation** (2009), about religious institutions as being “as any imperfect human institutions”[31]. Both protagonists lived in the

convent the way they lived outside it. In other words, they escape from their uncomfortable surrounding; however, they do not find comfort or ease there, as it was presumed. The protagonists passed wretched times there. So, they go in search for another option that may save them from their feeling of estrangement.

Erdrich Louise and Jean Rhys suggest 'Marriage' as a solution. It seems that if the two characters live with a partner, they may feel delivered. Marie escaped from the convent school. On the way, she meets 'Nector Kashpaw'. The latter believed that she stole some valuables from the 'Sacred Heart Convent'. His greediness expanded even his imagination, he says, "I assume she is running off with the Sisters' pillowcase and other valuables. Who knows? I think a chalice might be hidden beneath her skirt"[32]. Nector wanted to take profit of her in order to gain money "I may get money bonus"[33], he adds "I do not let Marie Lazzare go downhill"[34]. It seems that profit and money are the first things that drove him to Marie. Then, he had an unexpected sexual affair with her that day .

Similar to Marie, Antoinette's marriage started with greediness. The unnamed husband is an Englishman. He came to Jamaica to make his fortune and improve his financial situation, because his father expropriated him from his wealth. When Antoinette left the convent school, 'Richard Mason', her half brother arranged her marriage with this man quickly. He gave him thirty thousand pounds "The thirty thousand pounds have been paid to me without question or condition"[35]. So, this Englishman runs to marry Antoinette without knowing anything of her. When they went to 'Granbois' for their honey moon, Antoinette inherited her father's estate. Thus, all what the nameless husband knows is that he will inherit his wife's estate according to the British law. Erdrich Louise and Jean Rhys inform us that the protagonists' marriage started wrongly, so, one may ask does this seem "a return to normality"[36] or "a return to crisis"[37].

In ***Love Medicine*** things went speedily for Marie. They get married without knowing each other well. They get many children. She thought that she is safe and secure. However, the couple lackes love and intimacy. 'Nector' was in relationship with another woman, Lulu Lamartine, whom he loves so much. After more than seventeen years of marriage, he betrays his wife and leaves his children for this woman. He left a letter to Marie informing her that he does not love her as much as he loves Lulu: ''Sure I loved you once'', I apologize. I found true love with her. I do not have choice.''[38], he declares. Marie hides the letter, folded as she found it and she has never mentioned it even when he came back to her. She takes care of their children alone and works hard to feed them. She sacrifices painfully and silently to save her marriage and keep Nector close to her. She ensures nights waiting him to enter in order to prepare food for him. She has even used Lipsha's insights 'touch' to regain him but he went to Lulu and slept with her .Then, she tries to give him love medicine but he died. Erdrich Louise shows her protagonist alienated even from marriage too. She is suffering from her neglecting husband who rejects and betrays her.

Parallel to Marie, ***in Wide Sargasso Sea***, Antoinette is rejected by her husband .She was pleased that she has found the way to compensate the lack of affection that carries her since childhood. However, she does not pursuit security and protection as she expected. He left her alone and did not speak to her "sometimes he does not speak to me for hours and I cannot endure it any more"[39]. Even when she tries to approach him, he moves away from her. He does try neither to listen nor to understand his wife. Jean Rhys then depicts her protagonist's alienation in her marriage. The husband regards his wife as a stranger; he declares: "I did not love her. I was thirsty for her, but that is not love. I felt very little tenderness for her, she was a stranger to me, a stranger who did not think or feel as I did"[40]. She even tried to use folk magic with the help of Christophine's insights ''Obeah ''[41] to regain him, yet this failed. The same day she came back from Christophine, her husband

betrayed her with ‘Amélie’, her servant in a room next to Antoinette’s room. As a result, this created hatred feeling on her, she declares “I hate you and before I die I will show you how much I hate you”[42].

Erdrich Louise and Jean Rhys present their protagonist fallen in another kind of alienation and deception. Both protagonists failed in their option. They believed that marriage was a return to normality”[43] at the beginning; however, they find it “a return to crisis”[44] by the end.

Beside the above kinds of alienation, where the two protagonists have fallen because of their over estimation on their options, they fall in another kind of alienation. They are alienated because of their hybrid origins. This is not the protagonists’ choice but their surrounding taxation on them.

For Marie, she is excluded from both the Native American society and the White one. She is unable to belong to any of these worlds. Erdrich Louise describes her in a combat. On the one hand, she tried to deny her Indian American origin. She joins the ‘Sacred Heart Convent’ in order to be part of the White’s world. She asserts “No reservation girl had ever prayed so hard”[45]. She devotes herself to the catholic world; she declares “If this is God’s work, then I’ve done it all my life”[46]. Marie wants strongly to be accepted. However, she failed in her mission as a sister; as a result, she is rejected from the White community. Hence, she seeks for her origins in the Native American society. Marie wants to attain the fact that “mothering and Indianesse go together”[47]. She marries Nector, and they get many children. However, she is always regarded as “a white girl, dirty Lazzare”[48]. Erdrich Louise highlights the conditions of the mixed blood origins through Marie.

For Antoinette on the one hand, origins are presented in two collided worlds. She is regarded as odd in both the Caribbean and the British society. She tries to approach the Black

community through her friend ‘Tia’. She considers her as a close friend, unfortunately Tia betrays her. She took her pennies and clothes. She also called her “White cockroach”[49] and left her when their house has been burnt. It seems that Antoinette does not belong to the Black community since her childhood ;then, she get married with a man of British origins, yet, she is also rejected from it. Her husband does not see her more than a stranger, and “white nigger”[50]. Hence, he imprisoned her in England. Sylvia Panizza states that Antoinette strives to find a place in one universe or the other, to divest herself from all that is not purely White or purely Black”[51].

Erdrich Louise and Jean Rhys present the two heroines in two collided worlds. Consequently, they gained only a rejection that causes their alienation. They are unable to identify themselves with their cultures.

End notes:

[1] Erdrich, Louise.1993. Love Medicine. Harper Collins,08.

[2] Ibid,230

[3] Ibid,341

[4] Ibid,341

[5] Rhys, Jean. 1966.Wide SargassoSea.Longman, 120

[6] Ibid,158

[7] Ibid,34

[8] Ibid,92

[9] Ibid,140

[10] Ibid,49

[11] Erdrich, Louise.1993. Love Medicine. Harper Collins,230

[12] Ibid,342

[13] Ibid,342

[14] Ibid,342

[15] Ibid,366

[16] Ibid,39

[17] Rhys, Jean. 1966.Wide SargassoSea.Longman,155

[18] Bloom, Harold.2009. Bloom's Literary Themes: Alienation. Blake Hobby,87

[19] Erdrich, Louise.1993. Love Medicine. Harper Collins,53

[20] Ibid,53

[21] Ibid,44

[22] Rhys, Jean. 1966.Wide SargassoSea.Longman,72

[23] Ibid,72

[24] Ibid,73

[25] Ibid,73

[26] Ibid,74

[27] Ibid.,77

[28] Ibid.,74

[29] Erdrich, Louise.1993. Love Medicine. Harper Collins,54

[30] Rhys, Jean. 1966.Wide SargassoSea.Longman,74

[31] Bloom, Harold.2009. Bloom's Literary Themes: Alienation. Blake Hobby, 18.

[32] Erdrich, Louise.1993. Love Medicine. Harper Collins,62

[33] Ibid.,63

[34] Ibid.,63

[35] Rhys, Jean. 1966.Wide SargassoSea.Longman,90

[36] Bloom, Harold.2009. Bloom's Literary Themes: Alienation. Blake Hobby,19

[37] Ibid.,19

[38] Erdrich, Louise.1993. Love Medicine. Harper Collins,160

[39] Rhys, Jean. 1966.Wide SargassoSea.Longman,135

[40] Ibid.,113

[41] Ibid.,151

[42] Ibid.,178

[43] Bloom, Harold.2009. Bloom's Literary Themes: Alienation. Blake Hobby,19

[44] Ibid.,19

[45] Erdrich, Louise.1993. Love Medicine. Harper Collins,43

[46] Ibid.,51

[47]

URL: http://www.jstor.org/stable/41279516 Accessed: 19-07-2016 14:07 UTC

[48] Erdrich, Louise.1993. Love Medicine. Harper Collins,64

[49] Rhys, Jean. 1966.Wide SargassoSea.Longman,35

[50] Ibid.,56

[51] Silvia, Panizza.2009. Double Complexity in Jean Rhys Wide Sargasso Sea. Quaderni Di Palazzo Serra. Genova,6

Chapter two: Kinds of Alienation

This chapter suggests a parallel thematic study between ***Love Medicine*** and ***Wide Sargasso Sea*** in relationship to the subject of 'Alienation'. It has been clear from the previous chapter, that the common and prominent themes in both novels are related to social institutions such as family, marriage, religion and culture. In fact, these institutions work mainly to establish order in society and to delight the individuals' needs of protection, peace, communion and integration. However, when these organisms undergo a disorder, as it is the case in both novels, this is going to affect the individuals. These latter will be in struggle with their surroundings and with themselves. As a result, it will create in them kind of isolation, loss and estrangement. Such conditions and feelings are known as 'Alienation'. So, through this chapter we attempt to study the following themes in both works: alienation from family, alienation from religion, alienation from marriage and alienation from cultural belonging relying on Harold Bloom's theory.

a- Alienation from Family:

In this part, we intend to discuss the way that Erdrich Louise and Jean Rhys explore the theme of alienation from family in the two novels. We shall mainly focus on the relationship between the parents and their children, and how the formers create alienation on the latters.

Starting with ***Love Medicine***, Erdrich Louise describes Lipsha's family as disintegrated ones. The parents run for their personal interests, leaving their children seeking for protection and care. June Morissey, for instance, leaves Lipsha to live peacefully with her husband who ''couldn't handle another man's son''[1].

Erdrich Louise, then, portrays Lipsha destroyed psychologically when he becomes aware of his story. He declares ‘’ I turned odd’’[2] and ‘’It was a bleak sadness sweeping through my brain’’[3], he adds. He is confused, ‘’so unhappy’’[4] that he ‘’could die of it’’[5]. Lipsha is disillusioned by his mother’s rejection. He wishes death and prefers being orphan than being ‘’a found child, a throwaway’’[6] as he is regarded. He is ashamed of his mother. He lost direction; he does not know where to go or what to do. Then, he asks himself ‘’what exactly I wanted’’ and answers ‘’[7] I want to meet my Dad’’[8]. But, unfortunately, his father who should take care of him during this time is every time imprisoned because of his bad acts. Erdrich Louise tries to present this family as an embodiment to children’s issues within their family. Abandonment and irresponsibility create inner conflicts in children and fill their thoughts with loss and estrangement.

Moving to ***Wide Sargasso Sea***, Jean Rhys also portrays Antoinette’s family disunited. Her father is drunk, careless of his family. After his death, Antoinette does not show sadness to lose him as she expresses pain when he was alive. In addition, the mother’s plans do not include the interests of her young girl. All what she seeks for, is her own peace and a way to get rid of her poverty. She has never cared about her daughter’s presence or absence “My mother never asked me where I had been or what I had done”[9]. Antoinette lives with them and loneliness fills her mind and soul “So I spent most of my time in the kitchen which was in an outbuilding some way off”[10] or “I sat close to the old wall at the end of the garden”[11], she asserts. Antoinette feels that loneliness becomes her companion. Hence, she prefers to die rather than to know that she is “abandoned”[12]. She says “that would have been a better fate. To die and be forgotten and at peace”[13]. Jean Rhys’ theme of alienation from family complicates the lives of the children. It seems that the family is no longer a safe place or a peaceful atmosphere for them. It creates isolation more than company.

Erdrich Louise and Jean Rhys explain that the child's feeling of estrangement is due to his miscommunication and contact with his parents. It seems that both authors present their characters struggling alone to be protected and guided. The parents' role is not assumed, and the children's psychological stability does not exist.

b- Alienation from religion and Faith:

This part is devoted to the discussion of the theme of alienation from religion. By religion, we do not limit ourselves to God or Catholicism, we include also the Native American and Carribean shamanism. The individuals' struggle between these two beliefs creates alienation as it is the case with the characters in both narratives. They drive themselves to Religion to empower their faith that may save them from social damnation.

In Erdrich Louise's narrative, we notice that the first representative religious institution is the convent school. The author describes its role more as a source of alienation than reverence. She presents her characters, mainly the protagonist, disillusioned by the 'nuns' who are corrupted. Instead of being mentors to those who think of Christian religion as a refuge, they are obsessed by 'heaven' and each one is selfish to get there alone. We notice that in the novel, there is no one who prays from his depths, even 'Marie 'who desired to be "Pure and wide"[14] and "carved in pure gold"[15] becomes careless of hard praying when she joined the convent. Sister Leopolda insists that "Satan"[16] haunted Marie. Thus the latter is burned to get it out. Erdrich Louise shows at what extent the characters' religion is corrupted. Instead of getting the Satan out by hard praying, they burn a person. Thus, Pain and misery are connected to the convent and Christian religion.

Meanwhile, in Jean Rhys' narrative, the convent school does not prevent from alienation. Rhys shows that people may pray deeper outside the convent than inside. The protagonist finds it as a refuge but she is more connected to the outside, she cannot pray from

heart. She is haunted by sadness and loneliness rather than reverence to god. Moreover, the nuns speak of sins and hell more than heaven. Rhys shows her protagonist haunted by these ideas even in her dreams "I dreamed I was in Hell"[17].

The disillusionment of the two protagonists from the convent school and Christian religion extended to God. Erdrich Louise and Jean Rhys develop the theme of alienation through the loss of faith on god as a result of the corrupted religious institutions.

Erdrich Louise states "It was a poor convent"[18], and then she adds "Where God had only half a hand in creation"[19]. The characters of the novel deny the power of God. In a conversation between Lipsha and Nector, they declare: "was there any sense relying on a God whose ears was stopped?"[20]Erdrich's characters display God as being "deaf"[21] since he does not respond to the characters' appeal. In addition to this, Marie declares "I do not pray. When I was young, I vowed I never would be caught begging God. If I want something I get it for myself. I go to church only to show the old hens they don't get me down"[22]

Jean Rhys' characters deny the god's "possible existence"[23]. In a conversation between Antoinette and her husband, she says "you are always calling on God"[24], "Do you believe in God"[25]. This may show that Rhys' protagonist seems, she does not believe in it, because when she was asked by her husband "She raised her eyebrows and the corners of her mouth turned down in questioning mocking way"[26]. Then, she tells her husband that she loves Granbois and compares this place to God, she declares "it is as indifferent as this God you call on so often"[27].

It seems that both God and Religion do not solve the individuals from alienation. As Harold bloom affirms, God and Religion are "practical and consoling alternatives to alienation"[28] .Then, unfortunately, their conditions become worse because they feel in need to

appeal to their traditional beliefs and shamanism. They fall in ambivalence whether they adopt Christianity or they hold their old faith on.

In ***Love Medicine***, Erdrich Louise refers to the Native American shamanism through Lipsha's insights (touch) and love medicines. She portrays her characters suffering because of their struggle between Catholicism and their old faith. Lipsha's touch for instance, works sometimes and does not work in others. When her grandmother asked him to use his insight to get Nector back, the touch does not work. Therefore he brings turkeys' hearts as love medicine. He takes the hearts "to get official blessings from the priest"[29], then, from the saints. He does not get them. So, he blessed them himself but this fails also. Erdrich Louise makes a comparison between Catholicism and Native American shamanism, Lipsha says:

> Our Gods aren't perfect, is what I'm saying, but at least they come around. They'll do a favour if you ask them right. You don't have to yell. But you do have to know, like I said, how to ask in the right way. That makes problems, because to ask proper was an art that was lost to the Chippewas once the Catholics gained ground. Even now, I have to wonder if Higher Power turned it back, if we got to yell, or if we just don't speak its language[30]

Erdrich Louise delineates the struggle of her characters with religion and faith. Hence alienation is connected to their beliefs and they are always seeking for the stability of their faith.

Similarly, Jean Rhys shows clearly the ambivalent faith of her characters. They are struggling between catholic beliefs and folk certitudes. Antoinette for instance, asked Christophine to use her insights "Obeah"[31] in order to regain her husband. However, this failed also. It seems that the characters are alienated from both sides. They are unable to reach balance.

To conclude, Harold Bloom's statement that religion is "not a solution to the alienated condition of life in modern society"[32]seems the suitable concluding sentence to this part.

c- Alienation from Marriage:

Marriage is a sacred institution in society. It unites two individuals. These individuals share the best and the worst together in order to live a harmonious life, full of love and peace. It represents for many individuals an escape from the feeling of loneliness and estrangement. The marital relationship may face some conflicts that need the couple's sacrifices and as it is known, these latter come often from the wife. Yet, the woman needs only to be close to her husband, to feel protected and safe; otherwise, she will feel alienated from the husband carelessness and neglect. In this part, we intend to analyze this issue of alienation from marriage as a major theme in ***Love Medicine*** and ***Wide Sargasso Sea***.

To start with ***Love Medicine***, the author presents marriage as a prominent theme throughout the novel. For the protagonist, it is an escape from alienation for; she has already been disillusioned from religion. Therefore, she seeks protection and safety with her husband. Erdrich Louise points out that Marie sacrifices a lot in her marriage, however, alienation still haunts her. She is patient for Nector's betrayal with Lulu and takes care of her children in his long absence "One night and then another night he didn't come home"[33]. She adds "we needed some basics-salt, flour, sugar"[34]. This shows the hardship of Marie's situation during that time. However, she welcomed him when he comes back to her. Even when he lost his memory, she takes care of him, though; Lulu is the only person that he remembers from all his surrounding people. She insists on Lipsha to solve their relationship with his "touch"[35]. Then, when the latter fails, she tries a love medicine. Erdrich Louise insists on the woman's alienation and suffering with a careless husband. Harold Bloom declares that marriage has "no sense for communion"[36]

Parallel to ***Love Medicine***, alienation from marriage remains a prominent theme in ***Wide Sargasso Sea***. Jean Rhys presents marriage as a company to her protagonist whose mind and soul was haunted by loneliness in the convent school. She accepts to marry her husband in order to rescue herself from alienation. However, things go opposite to what she wishes. Rhys explains the reasons that lead to the woman's alienation from marriage as: rejection and betrayal. Therefore, she shows her heroine rejected by her husband who regards her as a stranger then, betrays her with Amélie. Rhys displays the sacrifices of Antoinette who stays with her husband and tries to keep the marriage happy. She has used "Obeah" and has even left her country to go with him to England. Rhys compares then marriage to exile since isolation and the feeling of estrangement follows the wife everywhere.

According to Harold Bloom's theory of Alienation and to the way that Erdrich Louise and Jean Rhys developed the theme of Alienation from marriage, the protagonists' sacrifices make them alone and the husbands' illegitimate relationships with other women outside marriage decrease the "sacrament of marriage"[37]. Therefore marriage has lost the "sense of communion"[38] and it "has brought only further division"[39] between the individuals.

d- Alienation from Cultural Belonging:

Culture differs from one society to another. It is connected to the origins of the individuals. For those of a single origin, they do not find problems to identify themselves with their culture. But for those of mixed origins, they find difficulties to identify which culture or society they belong to. In fact, they struggle with themselves and with the societies which they originate from, in order to feel the sense of cultural belonging. What follows in this part, is the discussion of the theme of alienation from cultural belonging in

both Erdrich Louise's ***Love Medicine*** and Jean Rhys ***Wide Sargasso Sea***, through their mixed blood characters.

Erdrich Louise explores the theme of alienation from cultural belonging through 'Marie'. She shows the mixed blood individuals' struggles to be accepted in the two societies while these latter reject them. The author presents Marie lost between both the Native American and Whites' culture. She struggles to integrate in each of them but she finds herself rejected from both. She denies her Indian American blood and tries to adopt Catholicism in order to be accepted in the Whites' community "I was going up there to pray as good as they could. Because I don't have that much Indian blood"[40]. However, they exclude her without reaching her will. Then, she comes back to integrate in Native American community through marriage, but she fails as well. She feels always alienated and regarded as a "white girl"[41] even though she believes in Native American Shamanism since she believes in Lipsha's touch and uses Love medicines.

Jean Rhys develops a parallel theme; she describes through Antoinette the complexities that stand in face of the Creoles who are seeking for a cultural integration either in the black community or in the British one. Unfortunately, they integrate in neither. Antoinette tries to set a friendship with the blacks through her friend 'Tia' but the latter betrays her and shows her disloyalty. Then, she tries to integrate in the British community by joining the convent school and marrying an Englishman, however, she fails. She is regarded by the blacks as "white cockroaches"[42] and by the British people as "white niggers"[43].

> It was a song about white cockroach. That's me. That's what they call all of us who were here before their own people in Africa sold them to slave traders. And I've heard English women call us white niggers. So between you I often wonder who I am and where is my country and where do I belong and why was I ever born at all [44]

Erdrich Louise and Jean Rhys outline the painful conditions of the mixed blood individuals. They portray them as imprisoners condemned to be odds and outsiders from both cultures since they are unable to belong to none of both sides.

End notes:

[1]Erdrich, Louise.1993. Love Medicine. Harper Collins, 337.

[2] Ibid.,338.

[3] Ibid.,338.

[4] Ibid.,338.

[5] Ibid.,338.

[6] Ibid.,304.

[7] Ibid.,340.

[8] Ibid.,340.

[9]Rhys, Jean. 1966.Wide SargassoSea.Longman,35.

[10] Ibid.,32.

[11] Ibid.,35.

[12] Ibid.,33.

[13] Ibid.,33.

[14] Erdrich, Louise.1993. Love Medicine. Harper Collins, 43.

[15] Ibid.,43

[16] Ibid.,59.

[17] Rhys, Jean. 1966.Wide SargassoSea.Longman,77.

[18] Erdrich, Louise.1993. Love Medicine. Harper Collins, 45.

[19] Ibid.,45.

[20] Ibid.,45.

[21] Ibid.,45.

[22] Ibid.,45.

[23] Bloom, Harold.2009. Bloom’s Literary Themes: Alienation. Blake Hobby,46.

[24] Rhys, Jean. 1966.Wide SargassoSea.Longman,154.

[25] Ibid.,154.

[26] Ibid.,154.

[27] Ibid.,156.

[28] Bloom, Harold.2009. Bloom’s Literary Themes: Alienation. Blake Hobby,46.

[29] Erdrich, Louise.1993. Love Medicine. Harper Collins,246.

[30] Ibid.,236.

[31] Rhys, Jean. 1966.Wide SargassoSea.Longman,178.

[32] Bloom, Harold.2009. Bloom's Literary Themes: Alienation. Blake Hobby,49.

[33] Erdrich, Louise.1993. Love Medicine. Harper Collins,93.

[34] Ibid.,93.

[35] Ibid.,254.

[36] Bloom, Harold.2009. Bloom's Literary Themes: Alienation. Blake Hobby,199.

[37] Bloom, Harold.2009. Bloom's Literary Themes: Alienation. Blake Hobby,199.

[38]Bloom, Harold.2009. Bloom's Literary Themes: Alienation. Blake Hobby,199.

[39]Bloom, Harold.2009. Bloom's Literary Themes: Alienation. Blake Hobby,198.

[40]Erdrich, Louise.1993. Love Medicine. Harper Collins,43.

[41] Ibid.,155.

[42] Rhys, Jean. 1966.Wide SargassoSea.Longman,155.

[43] Ibid.,155.

[44] Ibid.,155.

Chapter three: The Attitude of the Authors: Resistance to Alienation.

This last chapter is devoted to discuss the attitude of both authors toward alienation in both works. The above chapters made clear that the characters and the themes of both novels present a struggle against alienation. Both authors explore them in order to show the impact of this issue in society. Now, we are going to explore the diction, the imagery and the language of both novels, to reveal the authors' tone.

Starting with diction, the authors' choice of words and their connotations according to the subject of alienation seem to be similar in both works. Erdrich Louise uses mainly words related to pain, isolation and estrangement. These words affect the readers' emotions and create an understanding with the characters' condition. The author uses words such as "loss"[1], "darkness"[2], "loneliness"[3], "sadness"[4] and "confusion"[5], to depict the characters' feelings of alienation. The above words refer to sadness. They are repeated more than twice in the novel. However beside such words, Erdrich Louise uses others which refer to hope, such as: "the light"[6], "peace"[7] and "happiness"[8]. The writer seems to be challenging the issue of alienation. Thus, the readers may feel delivered and optimistic.

Parallel to Erdrich Louise, Jean Rhys uses words sounding sad. Words like:"sadness, loss"[9], "darkness"[10] and "hopelessness"[11]. They are connected to Antoinette's isolation and pain. The reader feels pity toward her. Yet, Rhys uses other words sounding hopeful. They affect the reader positively since they make him feel at ease. Words such as: "light"[12], "happiness"[13] and "safety"[14]. Rhys choice for the latter words shows her stance against the alienating conditions. The author tries to present the atmosphere softer to show that this condition may be temporary if we resist it.

Now, we move to analyze the imagery of both authors. The vivid images used in both works to refer to the theme of alienation are conveyed through “visual”, “auditory” and “Organic” ones. They appeal to the senses of: sight, emotions and feelings.

In ***Love Medicine***, Erdrich Louise uses some images in order to make the reader see the conditions that make the characters alienated. For instance, she describes the sadness of Lipsha when he is aware of his parents “So I let the tears fall, my hands shredding the bag”[15]. This visual image allows the reader to see his tears fall on his face and even imagine the way he is shredding the bag. Moreover, the author also uses auditory images to portray the loneliness of Marie such as “Eli would sing his song. Wild unholy songs. Cree songs that made you lonely”[16]. This image appeals to the auditory sense. It permits the reader to imagine himself listening to such song and it makes him feel alone and in solitude. In addition, Erdrich Louise presents some organic images. She describes Marie suffering and trying to combat her pain when she is pregnant and her husband neglects her “I tried to slow down, to rest, not let myself be overtaken, but soon the pains began to come together closer, so I had to rock myself in and out of the grip”[17]. Then, she expresses sadness in love and she depicts the world as being sad “It’s a sad world, though, when you can’t get love right even after trying it as many times as I have”[18]. The reader feels the pain and the deception that lead to the characters’ alienation. He identifies himself with them through emotions.

In ***Wide Sargasso Sea***, Jean Rhys uses visual images to depict the loneliness and sadness of Antoinette when she remembers her mother’s death “tears came to my mind again ‘such terrible things happen, ‘I said ‘why? Why?”[19] The reader may imagine that he sees the tears falling because of her estrangement. She uses auditory images as well to portray the protagonist’s grief. “The music was gay but the words were sad and her voice often quavered and broke on the high note”[20]. This image appeals the reader to listen to this music, to the words, imagine the way that Christophine sings and he makes sad as Antoinette too. Besides,

the author presents also organic images to make the reader sense the feelings of the protagonist. She describes Antoinette looking forward to die in order to achieve happiness in heaven “I could hardly wait for all this ecstasy and once I prayed for a long time to be dead”[21].

Erdrich Louise and Jean Rhys present such images to delineate the alienation of their characters and its effect on them such as sadness, loneliness and estrangement. These images appeal to three senses: the sight, the hearing and feelings. However, they use them as well to show their characters’ resistance to alienation.

Erdrich Louise uses visual images to show a kind of resistance to alienation. She describes Marie smiling to Sister Leopolda in order to show that she is well “I smiled? I glanced back and I smiled and looked up at her sly to see if she has noticed”[22]. The reader notices that this image presents a kind of resistance to the mistreatment of Sister Leopolda. Furthermore, Erdrich Louise appeals also to the reader’s auditory sense to show the happiness of Marie “She is laughing! It is too much. The Lazzare is laughing”[23]. This image allows us to imagine Marie and makes us hear her laugh as well. In addition, the organic images are also used to display the author’s trial to resist to alienation such as “I heard Sister Leopolda was dying, I told myself I was glad”[24]. This image displays Marie’s relief from alienation when she learns that the saint, who caused her estrangement, is dying. Thus, we feel her happiness and relief too.

Jean Rhys also presents images resistant to alienation. Starting with visual images, She describes Antoinette “very pleased”[25] and auditory images to reflect the ecstasy of the protagonist “She laughed at that. A crazy laugh”[26]. We can imagine ourselves as readers hearing Antoinette laughing loudly because she is happy. Now, we move to Rhys’ organic images to express her resistance to the bad conditions which surround her protagonist “I feel

very well”[27]. We notice that both authors use imagery to show a resistant attitude toward alienation.

Then, we study the language, the details and the syntax of both works. Erdrich Louise and Jean Rhys use a familiar language. We do not find jargon in both novels. This allows the reader to be familiar with the characters and understand the authors’ attitude easily. We see that they use simple words, clear ideas and descriptive language. Beside, both authors use informal language where they include contractions and expressions which refer to casual register. In ***Love Medicine***, for instance, Erdrich Louise use “I couldn’t”[28], “don’t”[29], “I’d”[30] and exclamations like: “Okay, no problem. Ha! Ha!”[31]. Meanwhile, Jean Rhys use “It doesn’t”[32], “I’ll”[33] and expressions like “Ah yes”[34]. This language makes the reader close to the characters and allows him to adapt easily to the situations that alienate them. Furthermore, both novels are related from the first point of view narrator. Both authors are subjective in relating and describing the conditions of the alienated characters. Erdrich Louise uses the first personal pronoun “I” twenty times in page forty eight. The events are told by ‘Marie’ in the convent school. The author’s choice to the first point perspective is to create connexions and understandings between the reader and the character. Similar to Erdrich, Rhys also uses the personal pronoun ‘I’ more than twenty times in page one hundred thirty seven. The over use of this personal pronoun may refer to the lack of communication between the characters and their alienation from one another. Both authors use monologues more than dialogues to depict the character’s thoughts, feelings and reactions toward their estrangement. H. Bloom argues that “this is a monologue in which each sentence constitutes a dialogue”[35] with the reader. Then, we notice sometimes that they express themselves through series of dots or repetition of words. In Love Medicine, Albertine tries to inform Lipsha of his mother, She says,“ your mother...”[36] . This sentence seems incomplete. Then, we see some repeated words throughout the novel such as “I was weak. I was weak”[37]. Analogously, jean Rhys’ characters form

incomplete sentences and use repeated words to express themselves. Antoinette for instance expresses herself like, “I wish...”[38], “Hours and hours and hours I thought”[39]. Sometimes, both authors present their characters struggling to communicate with each other. However, they often present them able to communicate accurately. In addition to this, Erdrich Louise and Jean Rhys often provide details that depict the inner thoughts and feelings of the characters. They use different kinds of sentences: simple , interrogative, imperative and exclamatory sentences to make their readers in friction with the characters in different situations, either when they are in loss , in alienation or in case of resistance toward the latter.

To sum up, we notice from our study to the diction, imagery, details, language and syntax in both works that both authors’ attitudes toward alienation is resistance. So, Erdrich Louise and Jean Rhys try to show the struggle of the individuals with alienation and their resistance against it. The characters are always trying to exceed their estrangement through their search for other options.

End notes:

[1] Erdrich, Louise.1993. Love Medicine. Harper Collins,47.
[2] Ibid.,258.

[3] Ibid.,366

[4] Ibid.,338

[5] Ibid.,338

[6] Ibid.,153

[7] Ibid.,55

[8] Ibid.,237

[9] Rhys, Jean. 1966.Wide Sargasso Sea. Longman,76
[10] Ibid.,187

[11] Ibid.,201

[12] Ibid.,55

[13] Ibid.,73

[14] Ibid.,99

[15] Erdrich, Louise.1993. Love Medicine. Harper Collins,340

[16] Ibid.,92

[17] Ibid.,101

[18] Ibid.,278

[19] Rhys, Jean. 1966.Wide Sargasso Sea. Longman.78

[20] Ibid.,32

[21] Ibid.,74

[22] Erdrich, Louise.1993. Love Medicine. Harper Collins,46

[23] Ibid.,64

[24] Ibid.,146

[25] Rhys, Jean. 1966.Wide Sargasso Sea. Longman,114

[26] Ibid.,178

[27] Ibid.,47

[28] Erdrich, Louise.1993. Love Medicine. Harper Collins,28

[29] Ibid.,49

[30] Ibid.,50

[31] Ibid.,192

[32] Rhys, Jean. 1966.Wide Sargasso Sea. Longman,106

[33] Ibid.,106

[34] Ibid.,101

[35] Bloom, Harold.2009. Bloom's Literary Themes: Alienation. Blake Hobby,131
[36] Erdrich, Louise.1993. Love Medicine. Harper Collins,39

[37] Ibid.,48

[38] Rhys, Jean. 1966.Wide Sargasso Sea. Longman,46

[39] Ibid.,72

V. General Conclusion:

Alienation is linked to man's existence. It troubles individuals in a way or another. This issue has inspired many writers as it has been the case of Erdrich Louise in ***Love Medicine*** and Jean Rhys in ***Wide Sargasso Sea.***

The present research work is a comparative study between Erdrich Louise's ***Love Medicine*** (1993) and Jean Rhys' ***Wide Sargasso Sea*** (1966). We have attempted to study alienation in both novels. We have applied Harold bloom's ***Bloom's Literary Themes: Alienation*** as a theory to analyze this issue through the characters, the themes, and then examine the attitude of both authors towards it.

The authors' concern on alienation in the two novels has been analogous, despite the fact that the two belong to different countries and cultures. We have noticed that if the alienating conditions that surround individuals are similar, they will be affected and have same feelings of disillusionment, disappointment and estrangement even in separated places in the world. Hence, although the characters of the two works are from different countries and have different cultures and way of life, the surrounding environment which disturbs them has been analogous. Therefore, the characters in ***love Medicine*** have been as alienated as those of ***Wide Sargasso Sea***; namenly, Lipsh a Morrissey and Antoinette Cosway as the alienated children and Marrie Lazzare and Antoinette Cosway as alienated female characters from marriage, religion and cultural belonging. Besides this, the themes of both narratives have been proved to be parallel in addition to the authors' attitude toward the issue of alienation which is resistance. These affinities between the two works which are written in Contemporary era have resulted from the affinities of both Erdrich Louise and Jean Rhys as: their hybrid origins and their interest on the same issue.

We hope that this research work is helpful for a better understanding of the affinities of the two works in relation to the issue of alienation. Moreover, we believe that further studies and research can explore other issues in both works such as: feminism and gender issues.

Bibliography:

Primary sources:

- Erdrich, Louise.1993. Love Medicine. Harper Collins
- Rhys, Jean. 1966.Wide Sargasso Sea. Longman

Secondary sources:

- Amoia, Alba Della Fazia and Bettina Liebowitz Knapp. 2004. Multicultural Writers Since 1945. Westport, conn.: Greenwood
- Andrea P, Balogh. 2008. The Impossibility of American Identity in Louise Erdrich's Love Medicine.
- Bloom, Harold.2009. Bloom's Literary Themes: Alienation. Blake Hobby
- Fromm, Erich. 1991. The Sane Society. London: Rutledge
- Loyd D.Easton and Kurt H. Guddat . 1967.From: Writings of the Young Marx on Philosophy Garden City, New York: Doubleday & Company (Anchor Books)
- Rula, B.Qawas. 2004. The Politics of Gender, Class, and Race in Jean Rhys Wide Sargasso Sea. DAR Publishers/ University of Jordan, 366.
- Sanders, Karla. 1998. "A Healthy Balance: Religion, Identity, and Community in Louise Erdrich's Love Medicine". MELUS 23 (2):129. doi: 10.2307/ 468016.
- Schoeffel, Melissa A. 2008. Maternal Conditions. New York: Peter Lang
- Silvia, Panizza.2009. Double Complexity in Jean Rhys Wide Sargasso Sea. Quaderni Di Palazzo Serra. Genova

Web sites:

- https://bibliojunkie.wordpress.com/2012/10/04/wide-sargasso-sea-by-jean-rhys/ accessed: 14-09-2016 12:51
- http://www.notablebiographies.com/newsmakers2/2005-A-Fi/Erdrich-Louise.html accessed: 14-09-2016 11:35
- URL: http://www.jstor.org/stable/41279516 Accessed: 19-07-2016 14:07 UTC